|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| NPRR Number | [1097](http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR1097) | NPRR Title | Create Resource Forced Outage Report |
|  | |  | |
| Date | | January 7, 2022 | |
|  | |  | |
| Submitter’s Information | | | |
| Name | | Michele Richmond | |
| E-mail Address | | michele@competitivepower.org | |
| Company | | Texas Competitive Power Advocates (TCPA) | |
| Phone Number | |  | |
| Cell Number | | 512-653-7447 | |
| Market Segment | | Not applicable | |

|  |
| --- |
| Comments |

TCPA appreciates the opportunity to provide comments to Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1097 and understands the desire for Outage transparency in emergency situations to better inform the public. However, balancing that transparency with meaningful and digestible information is just as important to providing better and clearer information to the public while protecting the public and Market Participants from release of information that is essentially a useless “data dump” to the average person but is competitively sensitive information that can be used by competitors to advantage the Market Participant’s position while not driving any additional value in the market.

Similarly, the goal is to provide meaningful information about the cause of actual Outages and informed expectations for resolution that will bring the Resource On-Line and at expected capacity. Three days is often insufficient time to understand an Outage cause, and a resolution timeframe is often unknown and cannot be provided with confidence. Thus, the information may be ambiguous and uninformative.

The proposed changes in the language would provide a seven-day timeframe that will yield better information for the public and reduce the potential for information about competitors’ Outages that could drive inefficient outcomes. Other proposed changes include aggregating Outages by fuel type which provides more meaningful information about which fuel types are seeing Outage problems and on what scale, as opposed to a data dump of codes, names, and numbers that is nearly impossible to understand without technical expertise and is indecipherable to the average person.

TCPA recommends moving forward with the NPRR as amended by these comments and looks forward to working with ERCOT and PUCT Staff to ensure transparency that provides useful and meaningful information without creating an unintended avenue for harm.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Revised Cover Page Language | |
| Revision Description | This Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) requires ERCOT to post a report providing information about Forced Outages, Maintenance Outages, and Forced Derates of Generation Resources and Energy Storage Resources (ESRs) seven days after each Operating Day and revises the expiration of the Protected Information status of this information consistent with this posting requirement.  This NPRR also provides that, following ERCOT’s declaration of an Energy Emergency Alert (EEA) Level 3, information about any Resource Outage or Derate that occurs during the EEA immediately loses its confidentiality. This feature is included in NPRR1084, Improvements to Reporting of Resource Outages and Derates. ERCOT intends to submit comments to NPRR1084 to remove the revisions to paragraph (1)(c) of Section 1.3.1.1 so that the expiration of confidentiality is addressed solely in this NPRR. |
| Business Case | On June 30, 2021, the Public Utility Commission (PUC) issued an order in Project No. 52266 waiving the 60-day confidentiality of Forced Outage and Maintenance Outages and directing ERCOT to publish certain information regarding these Outages on its website through September 2021. This information includes, for each generating unit, the name of the unit, the amount of unavailable capacity, the cause of the Outage, and when the generation unit is projected to return to service. The PUC’s order also limited the Protected Information status for this information to three business days. Stakeholders believe Forced Outage, Maintenance Outage, and Forced Derate information should continue to be disclosed in order to provide greater public awareness, while maintaining appropriate confidentiality of Resource-specific information. Stakeholders believe the seven-calendar-day confidentiality period proposed in this NPRR strikes an appropriate balance between the public need for disclosure and the Resource’s interest in ensuring confidentiality of commercially sensitive information. Further, three days has proven to often be insufficient time to ascertain the actual outage cause and often results in “other” being submitted as a placeholder due to lack of meaningful information. Seven days is proposed by Stakeholders as an appropriate timeframe to both provide transparency into Resource outages and also obtaining meaningful information regarding the outage cause. Furthermore, consistent with NPRR1084, stakeholders believe the circumstances of an EEA Level 3 would justify the immediate removal of confidentiality to enable public consideration of the impact of individual Outages and derates on the supply of generation. |

|  |
| --- |
| Revised Proposed Protocol Language |

**1.3.1.1 Items Considered Protected Information**

(1) Subject to the exclusions set out in Section 1.3.1.2, Items Not Considered Protected Information, and in Section 3.2.5, Publication of Resource and Load Information, “Protected Information” is information containing or revealing any of the following:

(a) Base Points, as calculated by ERCOT. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(b) Bids, offers, or pricing information identifiable to a specific Qualified Scheduling Entity (QSE) or Resource. The Protected Information status of part of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day, as follows:

(i) Ancillary Service Offers by Operating Hour for each Resource for all Ancillary Services submitted for the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) or any Supplemental Ancillary Services Market (SASM);

(ii) The quantity of Ancillary Service offered by Operating Hour for each Resource for all Ancillary Service submitted for the DAM or any SASM; and

(iii) Energy Offer Curve prices and quantities for each Settlement Interval by Resource. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire within seven days after the applicable Operating Day if required to be posted as part of paragraph (5) of Section 3.2.5 and within two days after the applicable Operating Day if required to be posted as part of paragraph (7) of Section 3.2.5;

|  |
| --- |
| ***[NPRR1013: Replace paragraph (b) above with the following upon system implementation of the Real-Time Co-Optimization (RTC) project:]***  (b) Bids, offers, or pricing information identifiable to a specific Qualified Scheduling Entity (QSE) or Resource. The Protected Information status of part of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day, as follows:  (i) Ancillary Service Offers by Operating Hour or Security-Constrained Economic Dispatch (SCED) interval for each Resource for all Ancillary Services submitted for the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) or Real-Time Market (RTM);  (ii) The quantity of Ancillary Service offered by Operating Hour or SCED interval for each Resource for all Ancillary Service submitted for the DAM or RTM; and  (iii) A Resource’s Energy Offer Curve prices and quantities by Operating Hour or SCED interval. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire within seven days after the applicable Operating Day if required to be posted as part of paragraph (5) of Section 3.2.5 and within two days after the applicable Operating Day if required to be posted as part of paragraph (7) of Section 3.2.5; |

(c) Status of Resources, including Outages, limitations, or scheduled or metered Resource data. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire as follows:

(i) For each Forced Outage, Maintenance Outage, or Forced Derate of a Generation Resource or Energy Storage Resource that occurs during or extends into an Operating Day, the Protected Information status of the following information shall expire seven days after the applicable Operating Day:

(A) The name of the Resource affected;

(B) The name of the QSE representing the Resource;

(C) The name of the Resource Entity;

(D) The Resource’s fuel type;

(E) The type of Outage or derate;

(F) The start date/time and the planned and actual end date/time;

(G) The Resource’s applicable Seasonal net maximum sustainable rating;

(H) The available MW during the Outage or derate; and

(I) The entry in the “nature of work” field in the Outage Scheduler and any other information concerning the cause of the Outage or derate;

(ii) For each Resource Outage or Forced Derate that occurs during, or that extends into, any time period in which ERCOT has declared an Energy Emergency Alert (EEA) Level 3, the Protected Information status of the information identified in paragraph (i) above shall expire immediately; and

(iii) For all other information, the Protected Information status shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(d) Current Operating Plans (COPs). The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(e) Ancillary Service Trades, Energy Trades, and Capacity Trades identifiable to a specific QSE or Resource. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 180 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(f) Ancillary Service Schedules identifiable to a specific QSE or Resource. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

|  |
| --- |
| ***[NPRR1013: Replace paragraph (f) above with the following upon system implementation of the Real-Time Co-Optimization (RTC) project:]***  (f) Ancillary Service awards identifiable to a specific QSE or Resource. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day; |

(g) Dispatch Instructions identifiable to a specific QSE or Resource, except for Reliability Unit Commitment (RUC) commitments and decommitments as provided in Section 5.5.3, Communication of RUC Commitments and Decommitments. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 180 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(h) Raw and Adjusted Metered Load (AML) data (demand and energy) identifiable to:

(i) A specific QSE or Load Serving Entity (LSE). The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 180 days after the applicable Operating Day; or

(ii) A specific Customer or Electric Service Identifier (ESI ID);

(i) Wholesale Storage Load (WSL) data identifiable to a specific QSE. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(j) Settlement Statements and Invoices identifiable to a specific QSE. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 180 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(k) Number of ESI IDs identifiable to a specific LSE. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 365 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(l) Information related to generation interconnection requests, to the extent such information is not otherwise publicly available. The Protected Information status of certain generation interconnection request information expires as provided in Section 1.3.1.4, Expiration of Protected Information Status;

(m) Resource-specific costs, design and engineering data, including such data submitted in connection with a verifiable cost appeal;

(n) Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) credit limits, the identity of bidders in a CRR Auction, or other bidding information identifiable to a specific CRR Account Holder. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire as follows:

(i) The Protected Information status of the identities of CRR bidders that become CRR Owners and the number and type of CRRs that they each own shall expire at the end of the CRR Auction in which the CRRs were first sold; and

(ii) The Protected Information status of all other CRR information identified above in item (n) shall expire six months after the end of the year in which the CRR was effective.

(o) Renewable Energy Credit (REC) account balances. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire three years after the REC Settlement period ends;

(p) Credit limits identifiable to a specific QSE;

(q) Any information that is designated as Protected Information in writing by Disclosing Party at the time the information is provided to Receiving Party except for information that is expressly designated not to be Protected Information by Section 1.3.1.2 or that, pursuant to Section 1.3.1.4, is no longer confidential;

(r) Any information compiled by a Market Participant on a Customer that in the normal course of a Market Participant’s business that makes possible the identification of any individual Customer by matching such information with the Customer’s name, address, account number, type of classification service, historical electricity usage, expected patterns of use, types of facilities used in providing service, individual contract terms and conditions, price, current charges, billing record, or any other information that a Customer has expressly requested not be disclosed (“Proprietary Customer Information”) unless the Customer has authorized the release for public disclosure of that information in a manner approved by the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT). Information that is redacted or organized in such a way as to make it impossible to identify the Customer to whom the information relates does not constitute Proprietary Customer Information;

(s) Any software, products of software, or other vendor information that ERCOT is required to keep confidential under its agreements;

(t) QSE, Transmission Service Provider (TSP), and Distribution Service Provider (DSP) backup plans collected by ERCOT under the Protocols or Other Binding Documents;

|  |
| --- |
| ***[NPRR857: Replace item (t) above with the following upon system implementation:]***  (t) QSE, Transmission Service Provider (TSP), Direct Current Tie Operator (DCTO), and Distribution Service Provider (DSP) backup plans collected by ERCOT under the Protocols or Other Binding Documents; |

(u) Direct Current Tie (DC Tie) Schedule information. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(v) Any Texas Standard Electronic Transaction (TX SET) transaction submitted by an LSE to ERCOT or received by an LSE from ERCOT. This paragraph does not apply to ERCOT’s compliance with:

(i) PUCT Substantive Rules on performance measure reporting;

(ii) These Protocols or Other Binding Documents; or

(iii) Any Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)-approved reporting requirements;

(w) Information concerning a Mothballed Generation Resource’s probability of return to service and expected lead time for returning to service submitted pursuant to Section 3.14.1.9, Generation Resource Status Updates;

(x) Information provided by Entities under Section 10.3.2.4, Reporting of Net Generation Capacity;

(y) Alternative fuel reserve capability and firm gas availability information submitted pursuant to Section 6.5.9.3.1, Operating Condition Notice, Section 6.5.9.3.2, Advisory, and Section 6.5.9.3.3, Watch, and as defined by the Operating Guides;

(z) Non-public financial information provided by a Counter-Party to ERCOT pursuant to meeting its credit qualification requirements as well as the QSE’s form of credit support;

(aa) ESI ID, identity of Retail Electric Provider (REP), and MWh consumption associated with transmission-level Customers that wish to have their Load excluded from the Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) calculation consistent with Section 14.5.3, End-Use Customers, and subsection (j) of P.U.C. Subst. R. 25.173, Goal for Renewable Energy;

(bb) Generation Resource emergency operations plans and weatherization plans;

(cc) Information provided by a Counter-Party under Section 16.16.3, Verification of Risk Management Framework;

(dd) Any data related to Load response capabilities that are self-arranged by the LSE or pursuant to a bilateral agreement between a specific LSE and its Customers, other than data either related to any service procured by ERCOT or non-LSE-specific aggregated data.  Such data includes pricing, dispatch instructions, and other proprietary information of the Load response product;

(ee) Status of Settlement Only Generators (SOGs), including Outages, limitations, or scheduled or metered output data, except that ERCOT may disclose output data from an SOG as part of an extract or forwarded TX SET transaction provided to the LSE associated with the ESI ID of the Premise where the SOG is located. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

|  |
| --- |
| ***[NPRR829 and NPRR995: Replace applicable portions of paragraph (ee) above with the following upon system implementation:]***  (ee) Status of Settlement Only Generators (SOGs) and Settlement Only Energy Storage System (SOESS), including Outages, limitations, schedules, metered output and withdrawal data, or data telemetered for use in the calculation of Real-Time Liability (RTL) as described in Section 16.11.4.3.2, Real-Time Liability Estimate, except that ERCOT may disclose metered output and withdrawal data from an SOG or SOESS as part of an extract or forwarded TX SET transaction provided to the LSE associated with the ESI ID of the Premise where the SOG is located. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day; |

(ff) Any documents or data submitted to ERCOT in connection with an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) proceeding. The Protected Information status of this information shall expire upon ERCOT’s issuance of a Market Notice indicating the disposition of the ADR proceeding pursuant to paragraph (1) of Section 20.9, Resolution of Alternative Dispute Resolution Proceedings and Notification to Market Participants, except to the extent the information continues to qualify as Protected Information pursuant to another paragraph of this Section 1.3.1.1;

(gg) Reasons for and future expectations of overrides to a specific Resource’s High Dispatch Limit (HDL) or Low Dispatch Limit (LDL). The Protected Information status of this information shall expire 60 days after the applicable Operating Day;

(hh) Information provided to ERCOT under Section 16.18, Cybersecurity Incident Notification, except that ERCOT may disclose general information concerning a Cybersecurity Incident in a Market Notice in accordance with paragraph (5) of Section 16.18 to assist Market Participants in mitigating risk associated with a Cybersecurity Incident; and

(ii) Information disclosed in response to paragraphs (1)-(4) of the Gas Pipeline Coordination section of Section 22, Attachment K, Declaration of Completion of Generation Resource Summer Weatherization Preparations and Natural Gas Pipeline Coordination for Resource Entities with Natural Gas Generation Resources, submitted to ERCOT in accordance with Section 3.21.1, Natural Gas Pipeline Coordination Requirements for Resource Entities with Natural Gas Generation Resources for Summer Preparedness and Summer Peak Load Season. The Protected Information status of Resource Outage information shall expire as provided in paragraph (1)(c) of Section 1.3.1.1.

3.1.4.8 Resource Forced Outage Report

(1) Seven days after each Operating Day, ERCOT shall post to the ERCOT website a report that identifies the total amount of Forced Outage, Maintenance Outage, and Forced Derates by fuel type of all Generation Resources or Energy Storage Resources (ESRs) that occurred during, or that extends into, that Operating Day.